

RELIABILITY AND REPRODUCIBILITY OF LEACHING PROCEDURES TO ESTIMATE THE MODES OF OCCURRENCE OF TRACE ELEMENTS IN COAL

Curtis A. Palmer, Marta R. Krasnow, Robert B. Finkelman and William M. d'Angelo;
U.S. Geological Survey, National Center, MS 958, Reston, VA 22092

Key words: Solvent leaching of coal, trace elements, reproducibility and reliability

INTRODUCTION

The 1990 amendments to the Clean Air Act have renewed interest in chemical forms or modes of occurrence of trace elements for potentially toxic trace elements in coal. Selective solvent leaching has been useful in estimating these modes of occurrence^{1,2,3,4,5}. This technique is much faster than previous attempts to determine the modes of occurrence of trace elements in coal, such as scanning electron microscopy⁶, analysis of density separates of coal^{7,8} and low-temperature ash⁹. However, relatively little has been published about the reproducibility and reliability of the solvent leaching procedure. For this paper, three previously analyzed coal samples were leached individually and (or) sequentially with 1*N* CH₃COONH₄, 2*N* HCl, 48% HF, and 2*N* HNO₃ using procedures described previously^{4,5}. The concentrations of 45 elements were determined by analyzing the leachate by inductively coupled argon plasma-atomic emission spectroscopy (ICAP-AES) and (or) the residue by instrumental neutron activation analysis (INAA).

RESULTS

The percent determined by both INAA and ICAP-AES of each element sequentially leached by each solvent in the Illinois #6 coal is given in Table 1. The method of determining the percent leached is different for each technique. The percent leached by ICAP-AES is calculated by:

$$(C_s V_s / W_s) / C_{wc} \times 100 \quad (1)$$

where C_s is the concentration of the element in solution V_s is the volume of the solution, W_s is the weight of the fraction prior to leaching (starting weight); and C_{wc} is the concentration of the element in the original whole coal sample given in Table 2. The percent leached in each fraction determined by INAA was calculated by

$$P_L - (C_{wc}W_s - C_wF / C_{wc}W_s) \times 100 \quad (2)$$

where P_L is the total percent leached by all fractions previously leached (P_L is zero for the CH₃COONH₄ fraction); C_w is the concentration of the element in the residue after leaching and W_F is the weight of the fraction after leaching (final weight). The errors calculated are based on counting statistics¹⁰ and are propagated through the calculations for the elements determined by INAA. Although the errors of concentrations determined by INAA are generally relatively low (1-10%), errors in the final calculation are much greater due to the subtractions and division in equation 2. Errors on individual elemental concentrations were not available for ICAP-AES. The data indicates that errors in these concentrations are generally higher than INAA errors, because more elements are near the detection limits of the ICAP-AES technique¹¹. Because equation 1 does not have subtraction terms, the overall errors may be comparable. In cases where the error was greater than the percent leached value, this value was converted to an upper limit and denoted by a * in the tables. In a few cases, equation 2 lead to a negative number. If that number was less than the calculated error, then the value was reported as an upper limit with a * as above; but when the value exceeded the error value, no value could be calculated and a ? was reported in a manner similar to Finkelman et al⁴ in 1990.

Considering the errors, there is generally good agreement between INAA and ICAP-AES results. The INAA results can also be evaluated against the data reported in the 1990 study included in Table 1. The comparison to previous data is generally good, but there are some exceptions. The 1:7 HNO₃ solution used in this study was more effective than 1:9 HNO₃. The differences in nitric acid leaching between this study and the 1990 study have been attributed to oxidation of the coal matrix by the stronger solution⁵.

Results for the Buelah-Zap lignite sample and the Lower Bakerstown coal sample (Tables 3-6) are similar to the results found for the Illinois #6 coal sample. The leaching study on the Lower Bakerstown coal was done in duplicate to further assist in evaluate reproducibility. Results from individual leaching experiments some in duplicate or triplicate can be found on Table 7. Many of these experiments were done in duplicate or triplicate. Hot (80° C) and room temperature (RT) HCl and HNO₃ acid were used to determine if differences in temperature were important. Generally, differences in temperature were not as significant as were differences in concentration.

- (1) Miller, R.N.; Given, P.H., A Geochemical Study of the Inorganic Constituents in Some Low Rank Coals, DOE, Final Report FE-2494-TR-1, 1986 314 pages.
- (2) Hurley, J.P.; Steadman, E.N.; Kleesattel, D.R. Distribution of Inorganics, DOE, Final Report for Period Ending March 31, 1988-1986, 320 pages.
- (3) Baxter, L.L.; Hardesty, D.R. Fate of Mineral Matter. In Hardesty, D.R. ed. Coal Combustion Science Quarterly Progress Report January-March 1992, Sandia Report SAND92-8210, 1992 p. 3-1-3-47.
- (4) Finkelman, R.B.; Palmer, C.A.; Krasnow, M.R.; Aruscavage, P.J.; Sellers, G.A.; Dulong, F.T. Energy and Fuels, 1990, 4(6) 755-768.
- (5) Palmer, C.A.; Krasnow, M.R.; Finkelman, R.B.; d' Angelo, W.M. Submitted to J. Coal Quality.
- (6) Finkelman, R.B., Modes of occurrence of trace elements in coal, US Geol. Surv. 1981, OFR 81-99. 301 pages.
- (7) Zubovic, P.; Standnichenko, T.; Sheffey, B. The Association of Minor Elements with Organic and Inorganic Phases of Coal, US Geol. Surv. 1980, Professional Paper No.400-B, p B84-B87.
- (8) Gluskoter, H.J.; Ruch, R.R.; Miller, W.G.; Cahill, R.A.; Dreher, G.B.; Kuhn, J.K., Trace elements in Coal: Occurrence and Distribution, IL Geol. Surv. 1977, Circular 499. 154 pages.
- (9) Palmer, C.A.; Filby, R.H. Fuel, 1984, 63, 318-326.
- (10) Palmer, C.A. Energy and Fuels, 1990, 4(5), 436-439
- (11) Doughten, M.W.; Gillison, J.R. Energy and Fuels, 1990, 4(5), 426-430

Table 1. Percent of selected elements sequentially leached from the Illinois #6 coal by different solvents. The concentrations of elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined by instrumental neutron activation analysis (INAA) on residue of the leached coal. The concentrations of the elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined directly by inductively coupled argon plasma atomic emission spectrometry (ICAP-AES) on the leached solutions. *=number converted to an upper limit due to high errors in calculations; ND= not determined, ? No value could be determined from data, 1990 refers to data previously reported by Finkelman et al.⁴

| Element-method | CH ₃ COONH ₄ | | HCl | | HF | | HNO ₃ | |
|----------------|------------------------------------|------|-------|------|-------|------|------------------|------|
| | Run1 | 1990 | Run1 | 1990 | Run1 | 1990 | Run1 | 1990 |
| B-ICAP-AES | 1 | ND | 32 | ND | 45 | ND | <18 | ND |
| Na-INAA | 73±4 | 65 | 10±5 | 0 | 15±6 | 0 | 6±0.4 | 15 |
| Na-ICAP-AES | 70 | ND | 12 | ND | <2 | ND | <3 | ND |
| Mg-ICAP-AES | 8 | ND | 7 | ND | 57 | ND | 142 | ND |
| Al-ICAP-AES | 17 | ND | 36 | ND | 42 | ND | 47 | ND |
| Si-ICAP-AES | 0 | ND | 1 | ND | ND | ND | 2 | ND |
| P-ICAP-AES | <44 | ND | <50 | ND | <58 | ND | <100 | ND |
| K-INAA | 9±7 | 13 | <12* | 0 | <91 | 78 | <10* | >7 |
| K-ICAP-AES | <21 | ND | <24 | ND | 81 | ND | <57 | ND |
| Ca-ICAP-AES | 71 | ND | 21 | ND | 2 | ND | 3 | ND |
| Sc-INAA | <10* | 0 | <23* | 15 | 64±14 | 32 | 20±16 | 4 |
| Ti-ICAP-AES | <2 | ND | 3 | ND | 81 | ND | 9 | ND |
| V-ICAP-AES | <20 | ND | 30 | ND | 219 | ND | 124 | ND |
| Cr-INAA | <1* | 0 | ? | 22 | 53±4 | 9 | 33±8 | 24 |
| Cr-ICAP-AES | <3 | ND | 22 | ND | 71 | ND | 52 | ND |
| Mn-ICAP-AES | 71 | ND | 21 | ND | 8 | ND | <8 | ND |
| Fe-INAA | 9±1 | 0 | 9±1 | 0 | 4±1 | 0 | 75±6 | 48 |
| Fe-ICAP-AES | 0.5 | ND | 4 | ND | 10 | ND | 122 | ND |
| Co-INAA | 10±1 | 19 | 47±2 | 39 | 15±3 | 0 | 23±4 | 7 |
| Co-ICAP-AES | <24 | ND | 43 | ND | <31 | ND | <64 | ND |
| Ni-INAA | 27±16 | 35 | <30* | 32 | 39±20 | 0 | 41±23 | 0 |
| Ni-ICAP-AES | 17 | ND | 36 | ND | 42 | ND | 47 | ND |
| Cu-ICAP-AES | <10 | ND | <11 | ND | <13 | ND | 78 | ND |
| Zn-INAA | 8±6 | ND | 21±9 | ND | 58±9 | ND | 12±10 | ND |
| Zn-ICAP-AES | <1 | ND | 26 | ND | 58 | ND | 18 | ND |
| As-INAA | 10±7 | 0 | 19±10 | 17 | <18* | 0 | 80±11 | 0 |
| Se-INAA | 21±4 | 0 | <7* | 0 | <7* | 0 | 65±5 | 0 |
| Br-INAA | 40±9 | 53 | ? | ? | ? | ? | ? | ? |
| Rb-INAA | <26* | ND | <27* | ND | 67±21 | ND | <38* | ND |
| Sr-INAA | <49* | 30 | <100* | 0 | <40* | 5 | <20* | ND |
| Sr-ICAP-AES | 36 | ND | 10 | ND | 19 | ND | 22 | ND |
| Y-ICAP-AES | <25 | ND | <29 | ND | <33 | ND | <69 | ND |
| Zr-ICAP-AES | <5 | ND | <5 | ND | 46 | ND | <12 | ND |
| Ag-ICAP-AES | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Sb-INAA | <16* | 0 | <16* | 13 | 22±11 | 0 | 60±13 | 6 |
| Cs-INAA | <2* | 0 | 15±7 | 0 | 71±8 | 0 | 20±8 | 88 |
| Ba-INAA | 28±13 | 11 | 22±19 | 25 | 31±20 | 9 | 20±15 | 8 |
| Ba-ICAP-AES | 32 | ND | 18 | ND | 35 | ND | 28 | ND |
| La-INAA | <3* | 0 | 38±3 | 37 | 11±2 | 4 | 43±1 | 29 |
| Ce-INAA | <10* | 8 | 45±15 | 38 | <25* | 0 | 40±17 | 24 |
| Ce-ICAP-AES | <17 | ND | 34 | ND | <22 | ND | <46 | ND |
| Nd-INAA | 20±12 | ND | <100* | ND | ? | ND | 58±20 | ND |
| Sm-INAA | 13±10 | 0 | 40±15 | 44 | <20* | 0 | 37±17 | 13 |
| Eu-INAA | 17±10 | 0 | 29±14 | 40 | <20* | 0 | 38±16 | 7 |
| Tb-INAA | 21±16 | 0 | <40* | 28 | <40* | 0 | 39±26 | 12 |
| Yb-INAA | <15* | 0 | <22* | 0 | 25±16 | 18 | 53±18 | 0 |
| Lu-INAA | <18* | ND | <38* | ND | <40* | ND | 55±28 | ND |
| Hf-INAA | ? | 0 | <2* | 8 | 62±11 | 23 | <12 | 9 |
| Ta-INAA | <16* | 0 | <18* | 0 | 48±17 | 0 | 36±19 | 0 |
| W-INAA | ? | 0 | ? | 0 | ? | 0 | ? | 0 |
| Pb-ICAP-AES | <24 | ND | 30 | ND | 12 | ND | 50 | ND |
| Th-INAA | <2* | 0 | 24±14 | 30 | <28* | 0 | 51±16 | 14 |
| U-INAA | <19* | 0 | <22* | 16 | 24±15 | 0 | 40±16 | 0 |

Table 2. Concentrations of trace elements in the original Illinois #6 coal sample in parts per million except as noted.

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------|------|------|--------|--------|-----|-------|--------|-------|------|------|-------|-------|
| B | Na | Mg | Al (%) | Si (%) | P | K (%) | Ca (%) | Sc | Ti | V | Cr | Mn |
| 160 | 1020 | 750 | 1.25 | 3.0 | 47 | 0.2 | 0.93 | 2.3 | 700 | 34.5 | 35.8 | 76 |
| Fe (%) | Co | Ni | Cu | Zn | As | Se | Br | Rb | Sr | Y | Zr | Ag |
| 2.7 | 4.4 | 30 | 10.1 | 201 | 4.7 | 4.2 | 5.72 | 16 | 32.2 | 4.1 | 22.8 | 0.62 |
| Sb | Cs | Ba | La | Ge | Nd | Sm | Eu | Tb | Yb | Lu | Hf | Ta |
| 0.84 | 0.94 | 86 | 5.99 | 10.2 | 6.5 | 1.03 | 0.226 | 0.134 | 0.47 | 0.06 | 0.435 | 0.176 |
| W | Pb | Th | U | | | | | | | | | |
| 1.51 | 8.6 | 1.65 | 4.27 | | | | | | | | | |

Table 3. Percent of selected elements sequentially leached from the Buelah-Zap lignite by different solvents. The concentrations of elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined by instrumental neutron activation analysis (INAA) on residue of the leached coal. The concentrations of the elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined directly by inductively coupled argon plasma atomic emission spectrometry (ICAP-AES) on the leached solutions. *number converted to an upper limit due to high errors in calculations; ND= not determined, ? No value could be determined from data, 1990 refers to data previously reported by Finkelman et al.⁴

| | CH ₃ COONH ₄ | | HCl | | HF | | HNO ₃ | |
|----------------|------------------------------------|------|-------|------|-------|------|------------------|------|
| Element-method | Run1 | 1990 | Run1 | 1990 | Run1 | 1990 | Run1 | 1990 |
| B-ICAP-AES | <17 | ND | 40 | ND | <26 | ND | <40 | ND |
| Na-INAA | 54±4 | 95 | 26±5 | 0 | 18±5 | 0 | 19±1 | 0 |
| Na-ICAP-AES | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Mg-ICAP-AES | 101 | ND | 11 | ND | 17 | ND | 42 | ND |
| Al-ICAP-AES | 1 | ND | 28 | ND | 66 | ND | 1 | ND |
| Si-ICAP-AES | <1 | ND | 10 | ND | ND | ND | 3 | ND |
| P-ICAP-AES | <22 | ND | 100 | ND | <34 | ND | <66 | ND |
| K-INAA | 41±21 | ? | <32* | 0 | <100 | >85 | <100 | ND |
| K-ICAP-AES | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Ca-ICAP-AES | 82 | ND | 23 | ND | 1 | ND | 0 | ND |
| Sc-INAA | ? | 0 | 50±6 | 15 | 45±11 | 32 | <13* | 4 |
| Ti-ICAP-AES | <7 | ND | 23 | ND | 66 | ND | <21 | ND |
| V-ICAP-AES | 167 | ND | <86 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Cr-INAA | ? | 14 | ? | 70 | ? | 0 | 22±6 | 0 |
| Cr-ICAP-AES | 371 | ND | <66 | ND | 203 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Mn-ICAP-AES | 46 | ND | 42 | ND | <5 | ND | <10 | ND |
| Fe-INAA | <10* | 15 | 37±14 | 0 | <28* | 0 | 50±22 | 0 |
| Fe-ICAP-AES | <1 | ND | 34 | ND | 9 | ND | 30 | ND |
| Co-INAA | ? | 5 | 75±5 | 58 | 13±7 | 0 | <12* | 0 |
| Co-ICAP-AES | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Ni-INAA | <17* | 0 | 32±14 | 0 | <44* | 0 | <30* | 0 |
| Ni-ICAP-AES | <27 | ND | 69 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Cu-ICAP-AES | 76 | ND | <32 | ND | <41 | ND | <79 | ND |
| Zn-INAA | 3±1 | 0 | <73* | 76 | <23* | 16 | <1* | 0 |
| Zn-ICAP-AES | <27 | ND | 82 | ND | 67 | ND | <79 | ND |
| As-INAA | <6* | 16 | 22±8 | 4 | 19±1 | 0 | 44±1 | 11 |
| Se-INAA | <17* | 0 | 9±6 | 0 | ? | 0 | 58±12 | 0 |
| Br-INAA | 1±0.1 | 0 | ? | ? | ? | ? | ? | ? |
| Rb-INAA | 16±8 | ND | <23* | ND | >23 | ND | >34* | ND |
| Sr-INAA | 64±1 | 45 | >32* | 54 | ? | 0 | ? | 0 |
| Sr-ICAP-AES | 76 | ND | 26 | ND | 1 | ND | <1* | ND |
| Y-ICAP-AES | <67 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Zr-ICAP-AES | <11 | ND | <13 | ND | 61 | ND | <33 | ND |
| Ag-ICAP-AES | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Sb-INAA | <13* | 0 | <19* | 0 | 68±30 | 14 | <40* | 30 |
| Cs-INAA | <10* | 0 | >46* | 0 | >68 | 82 | ? | ? |
| Ba-INAA | <13* | 23 | 71±13 | 73 | 29±15 | ? | <1 | ? |
| Ba-ICAP-AES | 18 | ND | 87 | ND | 16 | ND | 1 | ND |
| La-INAA | ? | 0 | 75±9 | 83 | 13±10 | 0 | <18* | 7 |
| Ce-INAA | ? | 14 | 69±13 | 70 | 18±13 | 0 | 14±8 | 7 |
| Co-ICAP-AES | <61 | ND | 92 | ND | <91 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Nd-INAA | 33±25 | ND | >47 | ND | 0 | ND | >16 | ND |
| Sm-INAA | <5* | 0 | 73±8 | 81 | 18±14 | 0 | <21* | 7 |
| Eu-INAA | <19* | 0 | 71±30 | 79 | >50 | 0 | <40* | 7 |
| Tb-INAA | <11* | 0 | 70±15 | 84 | 17±15 | 0 | <20* | 3 |
| Yb-INAA | <20* | 0 | 67±31 | 72 | <40* | 0 | <45* | 7 |
| Lu-INAA | <22* | ND | 64±18 | ND | <38* | ND | <28* | ND |
| Hf-INAA | ? | 0 | <10* | 0 | 81±10 | 55 | <10* | 0 |
| Ta-INAA | ? | 0 | <13* | 0 | 94±13 | 37 | 14±11 | 0 |
| W-INAA | ? | 0 | ? | 0 | ? | 0 | ? | 0 |
| Pb-ICAP-AES | <100 | ND | 172 | ND | <100 | ND | <100 | ND |
| Th-INAA | ? | 0 | 39±8 | 60 | 60±8 | 0 | 21±9 | 29 |
| U-INAA | <18* | 0 | 54±27 | 60 | 34±31 | 27 | <40* | 0 |

*includes amount leached by HF

Table 4. Concentrations of trace elements in the original Buelah-Zap lignite sample in parts per million except as noted.

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------|------|------|------|------|------|------|--------|------|------|-------|-------|------|
| B | Na | Mg | Al | Si | P | K | Ca (%) | Sc | Tl | V | Cr | Mn |
| 79 | 4960 | 3740 | 4000 | 6700 | 120 | 250 | 1.48 | 0.76 | 190 | 3.7 | 2.4 | 81 |
| Fe | Co | Ni | Cu | Zn | As | Se | Br | Rb | Sr | Y | Zr | Ag |
| 4800 | 0.82 | 5 | 5 | 5.23 | 2.63 | 0.59 | 1 | 0.93 | 530 | 2 | 12 | 0.14 |
| Sb | Cs | Ba | La | Ce | Nd | Sm | Eu | Tb | Yb | Lu | Hf | Ta |
| 0.173 | 0.5 | 610 | 2.67 | 3.92 | 2.3 | 0.4 | 0.081 | 0.52 | 0.26 | 0.036 | 0.293 | 0.92 |
| W | Pb | Th | U | | | | | | | | | |
| 0.38 | 1.5 | 0.9 | 0.41 | | | | | | | | | |

Table 5. Percent of selected elements sequentially leached from the Lower Bakerstown coal by different solvents. The concentrations of elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined by instrumental neutron activation analysis (INAA) on residue of the leached coal. The concentrations of the elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined directly by inductively coupled argon plasma atomic emission spectrometry (ICAP-AES) on the leached solutions. *=number converted to an upper limit due to high errors in calculations; ND= not determined, ? No value could be determined from data, 1990 refers to data previously reported by Finkelman et al.⁴

| Element-method | CH ₃ COONH ₄ | | | HCl | | | HF | | | HNO ₃ | | |
|----------------|------------------------------------|-------|------|-------|-------|------|-------|-------|------|------------------|-------|------|
| | Run1 | Run2 | 1990 | Run1 | Run2 | 1990 | Run1 | Run2 | 1990 | Run1 | Run2 | 1990 |
| B-ICAP-AES | <100 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND |
| Na-INAA | 10±4 | 10±4 | 0 | <7* | <10* | 0 | 75±5 | 75±5 | 65 | <8* | <9* | 0 |
| Na-ICAP-AES | 19 | 13 | ND | 8 | <9 | ND | 61 | 72 | ND | <13 | <16 | ND |
| Mg-ICAP-AES | 10 | 12 | ND | 6 | 7 | ND | 41 | 48 | ND | 5 | 5 | ND |
| Al-ICAP-AES | 59 | 45 | ND | 11 | 16 | ND | 36 | 24 | ND | 38 | <18 | ND |
| Si-ICAP-AES | <0.2 | <0.3 | ND | 0.3 | 0.5 | ND | ND | ND | ND | 4 | <1 | ND |
| P-ICAP-AES | 12 | <9 | ND | 54 | 78 | ND | 14 | 17 | ND | <13 | 19 | ND |
| K-INAA | <13* | <13* | 0 | <22* | <18* | 0 | >89 | >85 | >79 | >2 | >1 | ND |
| K-ICAP-AES | <58 | <88 | ND | <64 | <88 | ND | 84 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND |
| Ca-ICAP-AES | 75 | 66 | ND | 21 | 22 | ND | 18 | <18 | ND | 9 | 8 | ND |
| Sc-INAA | <3* | <3* | 8 | 14±3 | 15±3 | 63 | 33±3 | 31±3 | 23 | <3* | 6±3 | 0 |
| Tl-ICAP-AES | <4 | <3 | ND | <3 | <4 | ND | 49 | 53 | ND | 21 | 11 | ND |
| V-ICAP-AES | <20 | <30 | ND | <22 | <30 | ND | 49 | 52 | ND | <44 | <53 | ND |
| Cr-INAA | <4* | <4* | 0 | ? | ? | 0 | ? | ? | ? | 12 | ? | 11 |
| Cr-ICAP-AES | <12 | <17 | ND | <12 | <18 | ND | 104 | 109 | ND | 77 | 73 | ND |
| Mn-ICAP-AES | 65 | 60 | ND | <23 | <32 | ND | <26 | <39 | ND | <48 | <57 | ND |
| Fe-INAA | <12* | <11* | 15 | 29±7 | 42±7 | 26 | 29±7 | 23±7 | 8 | 40±8 | 33±8 | 4 |
| Fe-ICAP-AES | 17 | <0.2 | ND | 40 | 61 | ND | 8 | 8 | ND | 35 | 49 | ND |
| Co-INAA | 60±3 | 60±3 | 59 | 11±3 | 12±3 | 8 | <7* | <6* | 0 | 8±3 | 8±3 | 0 |
| Co-ICAP-AES | 79 | 67 | ND | <17 | <23 | ND | <19 | <28 | ND | <33 | <40 | ND |
| Ni-INAA | 39±14 | 39±14 | 55 | <38* | <19* | 0 | <19* | <19* | 0 | 22±18 | 34±18 | 0 |
| Ni-ICAP-AES | 59 | 45 | ND | 10 | 15 | ND | 36 | 24 | ND | 39 | <16 | ND |
| Cu-ICAP-AES | 46 | <15 | ND | 21 | 24 | ND | 21 | 30 | ND | <22 | <26 | ND |
| Zn-INAA | 53±6 | 53±6 | 64 | 31±8 | 19±8 | 21 | <9* | <13* | 0 | <11* | <11* | 0 |
| Zn-ICAP-AES | 72 | 64 | ND | 18 | 43 | ND | 9 | 9 | ND | <5 | 39 | ND |
| As-INAA | <5* | 6±4 | 0 | 57±5 | 46±5 | 41 | 15±6 | 16±6 | 6 | 30±5 | 30±5 | 6 |
| Se-INAA | <10* | <11* | 0 | <18* | <23* | 0 | <14* | <25* | 0 | 74±14 | 70±14 | 0 |
| Br-INAA | <4* | <4* | 0 | 7±4 | 17±4 | 19 | 9±4 | <4* | 15 | <40* | <40* | 0 |
| Rb-INAA | <24* | <24* | ND | <22* | <23* | ND | >91 | >90 | ND | >7 | >3 | 0 |
| Sr-INAA | <25* | <25* | 16 | <24* | <33* | 0 | 58±24 | 63±24 | 9 | <28* | <30* | 11 |
| Sr-ICAP-AES | 19 | 17 | ND | 7 | 9 | ND | 41 | 44 | ND | 8 | 8 | ND |
| Y-ICAP-AES | <31 | <47 | ND | <34 | <47 | ND | <39 | <57 | ND | <69 | <83 | ND |
| Zr-ICAP-AES | <6 | <10 | ND | <7 | <10 | ND | 30 | 36 | ND | 14 | <17 | ND |
| Ag-ICAP-AES | <100 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND | <100 | <100 | ND |
| Sb-INAA | <6* | <6* | 10 | 37±4 | 38±5 | 33 | 20±4 | 21±4 | 21 | 22±4 | 30±4 | 0 |
| Cs-INAA | <17* | <17* | 12 | <17* | <18* | ? | 84±19 | 85±20 | 37 | >21* | <21* | 14 |
| Ba-INAA | <17* | <17* | 23 | <19* | <19* | ? | 75±19 | 79±18 | ? | 17±15 | 23±18 | >23 |
| Ba-ICAP-AES | 22 | 11 | ND | 67 | 12 | ND | 27 | 19 | ND | 10 | <8 | ND |
| La-INAA | <4* | <4* | 0 | 10±5 | 11±5 | 0 | 13±5 | 16±5 | 5 | 25±4 | 34±4 | 22 |
| Ce-INAA | <4* | <4* | 0 | 14±4 | 14±4 | 3 | 12±5 | 14±4 | 0 | 22±5 | 34±3 | 22 |
| Ce-ICAP-AES | <20 | <30 | ND | <22 | <30 | ND | <25 | <37 | ND | <44 | <53 | ND |
| Nd-INAA | <19* | <19* | ND | 22±17 | 30±17 | ND | 17±1 | 16±3 | ND | 26±17 | 32±17 | ND |
| Sm-INAA | <3* | <3* | 0 | 22±5 | 19±4 | 9 | 10±4 | 12±4 | 0 | 15±4 | 24±4 | 17 |
| Eu-INAA | <5* | <5* | 0 | 28±7 | 23±6 | 14 | <14* | 9±7 | 7 | 12±7 | 22±7 | 16 |
| Tb-INAA | <7* | <7* | 0 | 23±10 | 20±10 | 15 | <16* | <10* | 0 | 12±10 | 23±10 | 16 |
| Yb-INAA | <12* | <12* | 20 | <18* | 16±9 | ? | 13±8 | <15* | ? | <15* | 17±8 | 9 |
| Lu-INAA | <8* | <8* | ND | <16* | <23* | ND | <17* | 11±8 | ND | 11±9 | 15±8 | ND |
| Hf-INAA | <10* | <10* | 0 | <8* | <10* | 0 | 41±8 | 40±8 | 21 | <9* | 10±8 | 7 |
| Tb-INAA | <9* | <9* | 0 | <20* | <13* | 0 | 19±13 | 17±12 | 0 | 19±12 | 34±12 | 0 |
| W-INAA | ? | ? | 0 | <25* | <23* | 0 | 42±24 | 40±21 | 15 | <30* | 26±19 | 0 |
| Au-INAA | >31 | >28 | ND | ? | ? | ND | ? | <32* | ND | ? | <33* | ND |
| Pb-ICAP-AES | 35 | <53 | ND | 62 | 101 | ND | 5 | <7 | ND | <79 | <94 | ND |
| Th-INAA | <4* | <4* | 0 | 9±5 | 13±4 | 0 | 9±4 | 9±4 | 6 | 15±4 | 16±4 | 10 |
| U-INAA | 15±13 | <20* | 0 | <18* | <18* | 0 | 37±17 | 24±17 | 22 | <24* | 19±17 | 9 |

Table 6. Concentrations of trace elements in the original Lower Bakerstown coal sample in parts per million except as noted.

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------|-------|------|--------|--------|------|------|--------|------|------|------|------|------|
| B | Na | Mg | Al (%) | Si (%) | P | K | Ca (%) | Sc | Tl | V | Cr | Mn |
| 2.86 | 170 | 330 | 0.74 | 1.07 | 360 | 700 | 1.4 | 2 | 430 | 10.4 | 9.1 | 9.7 |
| Fe (%) | Co | Ni | Cu | Zn | As | Se | Br | Rb | Sr | Y | Zr | Ag |
| 0.86 | 6.92 | 17.9 | 10.6 | 47.9 | 2.63 | 0.59 | 34.1 | 4.85 | 82 | 3.33 | 16 | 0.41 |
| Sb | Cs | Ba | La | Ce | Nd | Sm | Eu | Tb | Yb | Lu | Hf | Ta |
| 1.5 | 0.29 | 34 | 6.08 | 10.4 | 3.65 | 1.20 | 0.23 | 0.14 | 0.54 | 0.67 | 0.38 | 0.11 |
| W | Au | Pb | Th | U | | | | | | | | |
| 0.65 | 0.001 | 5.84 | 1.32 | 0.53 | | | | | | | | |

Table 7. Percent of selected elements leached from the Lower Bakerstown coal by different solvents. Individual experiments were conducted using room temperature solvents (RT) and 80°C solvents (hot). The numbers after RT and hot indicate run numbers. The concentrations of elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined by instrumental neutron activation analysis (INAA) on residue of the leached coal. The concentrations of the elements used to calculate the percent leached were determined directly by inductively coupled argon plasma atomic emission spectrometry (ICAP-AES) on the leached solutions. *=number converted to an upper limit due to high errors in calculations; ND= not determined, ? No value could be determined from data.

| | CH ₃ COONH ₄ | | | HCl | | | HF | | | HNO ₃ | | | |
|-------------|------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|------------------|-------|-------|------|
| Element | method | RT1 | RT1 | RT2 | RT3 | Hot1 | Hot2 | RT1 | RT1 | RT2 | RT3 | Hot1 | Hot2 |
| B-ICAP-AES | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 |
| Na-INAA | 9±4 | 17±3 | 15±3 | 19±3 | 31±4 | 30±4 | 86±4 | 35±4 | 25±4 | 19±4 | 18±4 | 30±4 | |
| Na-ICAP-AES | 15 | 16 | <58 | <58 | <58 | <65 | 124 | 31 | <59 | <65 | <65 | <65 | |
| Mg-ICAP-AES | 47 | 57 | 28 | 29 | 57 | 60 | 67 | 30 | 30 | 31 | 40 | 51 | |
| Al-ICAP-AES | 59 | 57 | <56 | <56 | 68 | 67 | 70 | 75 | 66 | 78 | 81 | 80 | |
| Si-ICAP-AES | <0.3 | 1 | <2 | <2 | 16 | 17 | ND | 3 | <2 | 17 | 6 | 7 | |
| P-ICAP-AES | <9 | 69 | 72 | 72 | 88 | 92 | 83 | 73 | 71 | 99 | 80 | 92 | |
| K-INAA | <13* | 12±10 | 13±11 | 12±11 | 37±11 | 39±11 | <99* | 31±10 | 15±11 | 13±11 | 16±11 | 22±11 | |
| K-ICAP-AES | <86 | <9 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | 99 | <86 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Ca-ICAP-AES | 62 | 77 | 100 | 97 | 121 | 131 | 41 | 108 | 106 | 119 | 117 | 135 | |
| Sc-INAA | <3* | 17±2 | 18±3 | 19±2 | 29±2 | 28±2 | 47±2 | 35±2 | 21±2 | 20±2 | 20±2 | 29±3 | |
| Ti-ICAP-AES | <4 | <43 | <23 | <23 | <23 | <26 | 54 | <4 | <23 | <25 | <23 | <26 | |
| V-ICAP-AES | <29 | <29 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | 57 | <29 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Cr-INAA | <6* | <4* | <6* | <4* | <4* | 9±4 | 23±4 | 15±4 | <7* | <5* | ? | 8±6 | |
| Cr-ICAP-AES | <17 | <17 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | 42 | <17 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Mn-ICAP-AES | 56 | 43 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | 68 | 40 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Fe-INAA | <4* | 49±4 | 48±4 | 53±3 | 54±4 | 53±4 | 59±4 | 97±5 | 98±5 | 98±5 | 98±5 | 98±5 | |
| Fe-ICAP-AES | <0.2 | 53 | 53 | 53 | 58 | 60 | 56 | 108 | 104 | 113 | 103 | 116 | |
| Co-INAA | 80±2 | 70±2 | 70±2 | 72±3 | 73±3 | 73±2 | 72±3 | 85±2 | 79±2 | 80±3 | 79±3 | 83±2 | |
| Co-ICAP-AES | 65 | 65 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | 65 | 73 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Ni-INAA | 33±13 | 44±13 | 50±13 | 51±13 | 46±13 | 61±13 | 59±13 | 70±13 | 63±13 | 65±13 | 61±13 | 68±13 | |
| Ni-ICAP-AES | 47 | 57 | <56 | <56 | 66 | 67 | 70 | 75 | 66 | 76 | 81 | 80 | |
| Cu-ICAP-AES | <14 | 31 | <94 | <94 | <94 | <100 | 57 | 87 | <94 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Zn-INAA | 57±8 | 84±5 | 84±5 | 85±5 | 86±5 | 85±5 | 85±5 | 93±5 | 87±5 | 86±5 | 83±5 | 90±5 | |
| Zn-ICAP-AES | 88 | 100 | 220 | 124 | 128 | 116 | 138 | 150 | 103 | 144 | 125 | 116 | |
| As-INAA | <5* | 60±4 | 59±4 | 62±4 | 61±4 | 60±4 | 65±4 | 96±4 | 84±4 | 96±4 | 96±4 | 95±4 | |
| Se-INAA | <10* | <10* | 21±9 | <15* | 11±10 | <15* | <15* | 86±10 | 57±10 | 58±10 | 49±9 | 78±10 | |
| Br-INAA | <4* | 11±3 | 18±3 | 16±3 | 73±3 | 73±3 | 29±3 | 57±3 | 36±3 | 23±3 | 23±3 | 44±3 | |
| Rb-INAA | <14* | <24* | <22* | 18±14 | 48±14 | 45±14 | 81±16 | 38±14 | <24* | 15±14 | <34* | 26±14 | |
| Sr-INAA | <18* | 23±17 | <34* | <29* | 64±18 | 73±18 | 52±17 | 61±17 | 40±20 | 30±17 | 22±17 | 49±17 | |
| Sr-ICAP-AES | 17 | 22 | 28 | 29 | 83 | 90 | 48 | 48 | 35 | 38 | 68 | 75 | |
| Y-ICAP-AES | <45 | <45 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <45 | <45 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Zr-ICAP-AES | <10 | <9 | <62 | <62 | <62 | <70 | 81 | <10 | <62 | <69 | <70 | <69 | |
| Ag-ICAP-AES | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | ND |
| Sb-INAA | <5* | 38±3 | 44±3 | 32±3 | 28±3 | 25±3 | 34±3 | 56±3 | 21±4 | 48±3 | 47±3 | 54±3 | |
| Cs-INAA | <14* | <17* | 18±12 | 22±12 | 56±13 | 56±13 | 76±14 | 42±12 | 15±12 | 27±12 | 23±12 | 36±14 | |
| Ba-INAA | <22* | <20* | <17* | <15* | 45±11 | 53±12 | 70±12 | 47±12 | <15* | 23±18 | >25 | 19±14 | |
| Ba-ICAP-AES | 15 | 12 | <30 | <30 | 84 | 72 | 141 | 29 | <29 | <33 | 49 | 54 | |
| La-INAA | <5* | 13±3 | 17±3 | 20±3 | 58±3 | 58±3 | 13±3 | 52±3 | 22±3 | 19±3 | 19±3 | 43±3 | |
| Ce-INAA | <3* | 15±4 | 21±4 | 24±3 | 59±3 | 59±3 | 9±3 | 55±3 | 25±3 | 24±3 | 23±3 | 47±3 | |
| Ce-ICAP-AES | <29 | <29 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <29 | 29 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Nd-INAA | <13* | 14±12 | <25* | 17±12 | 40±12 | 61±12 | <16* | 57±12 | 24±11 | <15* | 31±12 | 48±12 | |
| Sm-INAA | <5* | 25±3 | 29±3 | 30±3 | 59±3 | 58±3 | 11±3 | 59±3 | 36±3 | 32±3 | 32±3 | 50±3 | |
| Eu-INAA | <5* | 24±5 | 30±5 | 32±5 | 58±5 | 54±5 | 10±5 | 58±5 | 34±5 | 35±5 | 35±5 | 51±5 | |
| Tb-INAA | <7* | 17±7 | 29±7 | 28±7 | 40±7 | 39±7 | 8±7 | 43±7 | 27±7 | 27±7 | 24±7 | 42±7 | |
| Yb-INAA | <7* | 8±6 | <12* | 9±6 | 25±5 | 21±6 | <6* | 35±5 | 14±6 | 12±6 | 12±6 | 18±6 | |
| Lu-INAA | <6* | 11±6 | <13* | 13±7 | 23±5 | 24±5 | 8±5 | 34±5 | 16±5 | 13±6 | 9±8 | 24±8 | |
| Hf-INAA | <6* | <9* | ? | <6* | <12* | 8±6 | 40±6 | 12±6 | <6* | <11* | <13* | 7±6 | |
| Ta-INAA | ? | ? | ? | ? | ? | ? | <13* | <9* | ? | ? | ? | ? | |
| W-INAA | ? | ? | ? | ? | <14* | ? | 23±13 | <14* | ? | ? | ? | ? | |
| Au-INAA | <60* | <44* | 33±30 | ? | 59±33 | <31* | ? | <32* | <42* | <56* | ? | ? | |
| Pb-ICAP-AES | <52 | 93 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | 32 | 98 | <100 | <100 | <100 | <100 | |
| Th-INAA | <3* | 9±3 | 10±5 | 13±3 | 29±3 | 29±3 | 8±3 | 32±3 | 14±3 | 17±5 | 15±3 | 25±4 | |
| U-INAA | <24* | <19* | <24* | 34±12 | 29±11 | 32±11 | 21±12 | 44±11 | 23±12 | 28±12 | 20±12 | 36±12 | |